

The first Human settlements out Africa into Europe: a chronological perspective

Christophe Falgueres

► To cite this version:

Christophe Falgueres. The first Human settlements out Africa into Europe: a chronological perspective. Quaternary Science Reviews, 2020, 247, pp.106551. 10.1016/j.quascirev.2020.106551. hal-03013909

HAL Id: hal-03013909 https://cnrs.hal.science/hal-03013909

Submitted on 19 Nov 2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial - NoDerivatives 4.0 International License

1 The first Human settlements out Africa into Europe: a chronological perspective

- 2
- 3 Christophe Falguères
- 4 Département Homme et Environnement, UMR7194
- 5 Muséum national d'histoire naturelle
- 6 Sorbonne Université
- 7 Institut de Paléontologie Humaine, Paris, France
- 8 Tel +33 1 55 43 27 36
- 9 Email : <u>christophe.falgueres@mnhn.fr</u>
- 10

11 Abstract

12 A reliable chronology for the oldest settlements of Europe from the Early to the beginning of the Middle Pleistocene is an important requirement for understanding human evolution and 13 especially the routes used to reach Western Europe from Africa. The paucity of sites, plus 14 the limited number of available samples for dating, and the many contexts which do not 15 16 favor the use of particular dating methods, further complicate the picture. This contribution 17 addresses several questions: Which dating methods are relevant for establishing the 18 chronology of the main sites? Are the first settlements older than the Jaramillo event? 19 Which routes were used to enter Europe? Were the earliest human occupations intermittent or continuous? 20

21

22 Key-words: Early and Middle Pleistocene, dating methods, human evolution, Europe

23

Highlights: Contribution of dating methods and their reliability to the knowledge of the
oldest human settlements in Europe, first before Jaramillo event, and then during the early
period of Middle Pleistocene.

27

28 1/ Introduction

Few prehistoric sites in Europe and around the Mediterranean Basin document the Early 29 Pleistocene period (i.e. 2 to 0.8Ma). The lack of a reliable chronological framework is a major 30 31 issue in considering the possibility that the first European human occupations took place 32 before the Jaramillo subchron. Some authors suggest that the earliest settlements in Europe occurred between the Jaramillo subchron and the Brunhes-Matuyama boundary, about 1.0 33 34 and 0.8 Ma including MIS22, the first important cold stage of the Pleistocene (Muttoni et al., 2010). This 200 ka period coincides with the late Early Pleistocene global climate transition. 35 The survey relies on sites including magnetostratigraphy and radiometric dates based 36 37 essentially on K-Ar and Ar-Ar dates performed mainly on Italian sites. Other researchers are in favor of older human dispersals peopling Europe before 1.1 Ma particularly in Spain, 38 France and Italy where some radiometric dates are associated with magnetostratigraphic 39 data and biochronologic studies (Arzarello et al., 2007; Carbonell et al., 2008; Garcia et al., 40 2014; Michel et al., 2017;). 41

With the exception of Dmanisi in Georgia, for which ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar dates plus palaeomagnetic 42 43 data suggest that hominins reached the Caucasus 1.8 Ma ago from Africa (Gabunia et al., 2000; Garcia et al., 2010), most other relevant sites are not reliably dated mainly because of 44 the absence of volcanic layers "associated" with archaeological horizons. Few dating 45 methods are available to this time period, and chronometric ages need to be compared with 46 results obtained by other methods such as biochronology and magnetostratigraphy. 47 Archaeological and palaeoenvironmental evidence, though scarce, suggest that while 48 Western Europe was initially inhabited by hominins from 1.4 to 0.8 Ma, the archaeological 49 record suggests that a continuous human occupation did not occur until later (Dennell et al., 50 2011; MacDonald et al., 2012). From the end of Lower Pleistocene, the strong climatic 51 amplitudes that prevail with major longer periods of glaciations and the absence of human 52 53 control of fire, (Roebroeks and Villa, 2011) could be a reason for the episodic human

presence particularly in northern Europe until at least 600-700 ka with the arrival of technological Acheulean assemblages (Lefèvre et al., 2010; Moncel et al., 2013; Mosquera et al., 2013). Furthermore, the scarcity of sites found between 1 Ma and 600 ka emphasizes the difficulty of postulating for an eventual continuity in the peopling of Europe.

The issue of the routes to enter Europe is not solved though the main and oldest way to 58 59 leave Africa was likely the Levantine corridor, the only one terrestrial gateway. The site of Dmanisi, located 2000 km straight to the north in the Caucasus region, at the crossroads of 60 Europe and Asia, was probably reached by using this route (Figure 1). The other possibilities 61 62 to reach Europe from Africa are Turkey with an access to Europe by the Bosphorus, and also Spain by the Gibraltar strait and this will be discussed in the paper. The last possibility could 63 be an access by Sicily considering that the Italian peninsula has very old sites such as Pirro 64 Nord and Montepoggiolo, although only upper Palaeolithic sites presently attest a human 65 presence in the largest Mediterranean island (Di Maida et al., 2019) which was never 66 67 connected with the continent.

In this work we rely on chronology using dating methods other than argon-argon particularly 68 in karstic environments and on open-air sites without a volcanic context to demonstrate the 69 presence of hominins before the Jaramillo event in Europe. This is notably the case with 70 71 paleodosimetric methods such as electron spin resonance (ESR) applied to detrital quartz 72 which has provided the opportunity to date old open-air sites in northern Europe (Voinchet et al., 2010) but also important sites in karstic environment such as the lowest layers of Gran 73 Dolina (Moreno et al., 2015). The ESR method when combined with uranium-series is also 74 applied to fossil dental enamel of large herbivores and yields modelled ages (Grün et al., 75 1988; Shao et al., 2012) which are compared with palaeomagnetic and mammalian 76 biozonation data to cross-check and constrain the results particularly for the Early 77 78 Pleistocene period. The multi-methods approach allows the building of a chronological

framework by providing guide-marks for these old sites. A review of the oldest European and North-African sites is presented including those whose ages are already published. The main sites post Brunhes-Matuyama are also presented with the dating methods that can be applied according the environmental contexts are discussed.

- 83
- 84 **2/ The appropriate dating methods**

The most efficient way to provide a reliable chronological framework to a prehistoric site is 85 to combine and compare results obtained from different independent dating methods and 86 87 also with those yielded by magnetostratigraphic and biochronologic data as far as it is possible. Several analyses should be performed on the same layer in order to test the 88 reliability and the ages should increase with the stratigraphic order. Figure 2 shows the main 89 dating methods and their potentially applicable range in the Quaternary period. The 90 ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar method is considered as a reference when it can be applied to volcanic layers 91 92 found in secure stratigraphic association with archaeological sequences. Among the 17-20 93 mentioned sites in the Figure 1, only two are located in volcanic environment, Dmanisi, where a basalt formation and ash layer underlie the archaeological sequence, and Bois-de-94 Riquet in France in which the basalt formation is much older than the archaeological 95 sequence as explained in the next part. At Dmanisi, argon dates performed on the Masavera 96 basalt formation gave a maximum age of 1.85 ± 0.01 Ma and palaeomagnetic data yielded a 97 normal polarity, both combined supporting a correlation with the Olduvai subchron 98 (Gabunia et al., 2000). Other ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar analyses were performed on glass grains coming from 99 100 an ash layer that fits closely with the "fresh" upper surface of the basalt. The samples were extracted from two locations: site A corresponds to the main sector (sector II) in which the 101 102 major part of human remains were found; site B is a pit dug through sediments down to the 103 Basalt lava flow close to the site A. A weighted mean age from the two distinct locations of

1.81 ± 0.03 Ma, in agreement with previous dating, was obtained for the hominins making
them the oldest Eurasians (Garcia et al., 2010).

The period ranging between 2 and 1 Ma is particularly difficult to date when no volcanic 106 layers underlie or seal prehistoric sequences. Uranium-series dating, based on the ingrowth 107 of ²³⁰Th cannot cover this period even though mass spectrometry has improved the accuracy 108 and pushed back the applicable age limits to ca. 600 ka with a small error range thanks to 109 110 Faraday collectors used to measure thorium isotopes in optimal conditions (Potter et al., 2005). U-Pb geochronology of speleothems has for more than 20 years been capable of 111 extending this age range (Woodhead et al., 2006). When samples contain enough Pb, usually 112 113 in low contents in these kinds of samples, to obtain isotopic ratio for isochron construction, and where very low "common Pb" is observed, it becomes possible to get reliable ages. U-Pb 114 115 dating in this way showed that a calcitic formation in Corchia Cave, Italy, grew between 970-810 ka with a precision of less than 0.5% (Bajo et al., 2012). This method applied to 116 speleothem formations is however difficult to implement effectively because the oldest 117 European sites are generally not in caves, with the exception of the Vallonnet and Atapuerca 118 119 sites. For the French cave, U-Pb ages coupled to a reversed polarity of calcite samples, provide age range constraining the archaeological infilling between 1.2 to 1.1 Ma (Michel et 120 121 al., 2017). New attempts were performed in the lowest levels of Gran Dolina (flowstones at the top of TD1) without success due to large variations and very low Pb concentrations 122 (Pares et al., 2018). 123

As Ar/Ar and Fission track methods are not available in detritic environments or karstic systems furthermore without speleothem formations, only cosmogenic and palaeodosimetric methods can be applied for dating the period ranging between 2.0 and 1.0 Ma.

Dating burial of quaternary sediment using *in-situ* production of cosmogenic radionuclides 128 (CRN) is a relatively recent method (Granger and Musikar, 2001). As the ratio of the 129 production rates of aluminium (²⁶Al) and beryllium (¹⁰Be) is well known, and because their 130 131 half-lives are long enough, these nuclides can be used to date sediment burial of the order of a million years. The procurement of reliable dates depends on the depth and the rapidity of 132 the buried sediment to prevent cosmogenic nuclide production after burial. This technique 133 offers opportunities to yield ages between 1 and 5 Ma, potentially covering the oldest 134 human sites in Europe and elsewhere. Examples of applications of this approach include 135 136 Atapuerca Elefante where level TE9 containing a human mandible fragment associated with lithic assemblage and faunal remains was dated to 1.3 -1.1 Ma (Carbonell et al., 2008), and 137 the long sequence having provided travertines, including the Kocabas hominin skull, and 138 139 conglomerates was dated to 1.6-1.2 Ma (Lebatard et al., 2014).

140 In spite of difficulties such as sensitivity and large absolute error ranges, palaeodosimetric 141 methods have a good potential to date old sites because they can be applied either on 142 sediments or directly on faunal remains or on burnt flints that are coeval with human 143 bearing occupations.

The ESR method can be implemented on several types of samples which confers a good 144 145 potential to this technique. When applied to detrital quartz, though the bleaching process 146 mechanism is not yet well understood, ESR has provided results from open sites in the northern part of Europe which could not be dated by other techniques. For example, in the 147 Middle Loire Basin, two distinct phases of human settlements were evidenced around 1.1 148 Ma and 0.7 Ma, and particularly the Acheulean handaxe industries of La Noira, Brinay 149 150 (Voinchet et al., 2010) (Figure 3). New applications were also performed on quartz coming from karstic environments at Atapuerca. The lowest levels of Gran Dolina were dated by ESR 151 on quartz to more than 1 Ma (Moreno et al., 2015) in agreement with magnetostratigraphic 152

data and other chronological evidence (Pares et al., 2018) providing to the ESR results with a good reliability. Recently, in the Philippines, hominin presence was estimated to be more than 0.7 Ma thanks to ESR dates obtained both on quartz and teeth pushing back the colonization of these islands by more than 600 ka (Ingicco et al., 2018). Presently, when old sites are not located in volcanic areas, the ESR method applied on optically bleached quartz, thanks to the good stability of Al center, is the only alternative able to provide ages as far as 2.5 Ma (Sahnouni et al., 2018).

The combined ESR/U-series (ESR-US) method applied on fossil enamel takes into account 160 both ESR and U-series data, including radioelement contents, isotopic ratios, palaeodoses 161 and external gamma-dose rate. It allows the reconstruction of the uranium uptake history in 162 each dental tissue using a specific U-uptake parameter, p-value (Grün et al., 1988). The 163 164 model cannot account for uranium loss. A recent model, called accelerating uptake model, AU-ESR, describes U-uptake into dental tissue as an accelerating process by the introduction 165 of two parameters, the initial uptake rate and the acceleration of this uptake rate. It allows 166 an extension for samples exhibiting a slight uranium leaching (Shao et al., 2012). 167

The combined approach allows the dating on herbivorous and/or human teeth during all the 168 Middle Pleistocene period (Grün, 2006; Falguères et al., 2010). For the Lower Pleistocene 169 170 Spanish sites, a review of the main difficulties using combined ESR/U-series methods applied to fossil enamel teeth was published bringing to light the difficulties to date such a period 171 (Duval et al., 2012). The problem of uranium uptake (open system behaviour) in the different 172 tissues of teeth is often influenced by specific geochemical and geological context, in some 173 cases does not allow the calculation of a modelled age. In human teeth fragments, an 174 175 underestimation of some palaeodoses was explained by the possible creation of unstable non-oriented CO_2 radicals after artificial gamma irradiation and heating identified as a 176

source of error in D_e assessment (Grün et al., 2008). The mathematical description of ESR 177 dose response of fossil tooth enamel has been discussed recently showing that for D_e higher 178 179 than 2000 Gy, a single saturating exponential (SSE) function could lead to some overestimation of the results (Duval and Grün, 2016). For De values lower than 2000 Gy, a 180 single saturating exponential plus linear function (EXPLIN) better describes the growth 181 curves. For Arago teeth dated to 530-300 ka, EXPLIN function was used to calculate De 182 because presenting slight better r2 adjustment and smaller error range providing results 183 lower from 1 to 12% than using SSE fitting (Falguères et al., 2015). 184

The limits of Luminescence methods applicability have been recently extended to 0.8 to 1Ma at Gran Dolina and Sima del Elefante by using techniques such as thermally transferred optically stimulated luminescence (TT-OSL) and post-infrared stimulated luminescence (pIR-IRSL) and contribute to better constrain the chronological framework of the Pleistocene period (Arnold et al., 2015) but remain still difficult to implement on samples older than 1 Ma.

191 **3/ The oldest sites**

Recently human presence in Western Europe before 1 Ma has been discussed (Muttoni et 192 al., 2018; 2015). Bearing in mind the large uncertainties of absolute dating methods, these 193 194 authors propose a critical assessment based on magnetic stratigraphy which favours the 195 MIS22 period between the normal polarity Jaramillo subchron, 1.07-0.99 Ma, and the 196 Brunhes-Matuyama boundary, 0.78 Ma, for the earliest hominin settlements. During MIS22, it is argued an onset of increasing aridity in Sahara, combined with other climatic 197 constraints, led herds to move from Africa to the southern part of Europe. On the other 198 hand, some researchers support the idea that the first hominins arrived in Europe before the 199 Jaramillo subchron considering a pool of data from several disciplines including those 200

201 provided by dating methods whose large error ranges are constrained by results obtained by202 a multidisciplinary approach.

203 The site of Dmanisi which documents the presence of early Homo outside Africa at 1.8 Ma, 204 represents more than 90% of the human remains found during the period ranging between 2.0 to 0.8 Ma. The study of an entire well preserved skull associated with his mandible 205 suggests strong affinities with "the earliest known Homo fossils from Africa" (Lordkipanidze 206 et al., 2013). The lithic assemblage ressembles the Oldowan tradition found at African sites 207 which is referred to as Mode 1 tradition in Europe, and including core choppers, flakes and 208 209 retouched flakes. It is associated with a large vertebrate fauna contemporaneous with a 210 latest Pliocene-earliest Pleistocene age (Gabunia et al., 2000). Because of its antiquity and because human remains were found in a well-established stratigraphic sequence dated by 211 Ar/Ar method coupled to magnetostratigraphic data, it is a key-site for the understanding of 212 213 human dispersals in Eurasia and probably a starting point of human European settlements.

214 2 000 km southward, in Jordan Valley, the site of Ubeidiya has yielded some human remains 215 such as cranial fragments and teeth in association with lithic assemblages and abundant fauna. The Ubeidiya formation constituted mainly with fluvial sediments has indicated a 216 reversed polarity and some faunal elements are biochronologically dated to 1.1 to 1.5 Ma 217 (Belmaker et al., 2002). The lithic artefacts are constituted by choppers including "a small 218 219 but distinctive group of crude bifaces" (Bar-Yosef and Goren-Inbar, 1993) suggesting that the hominins that left Africa and reached Dmanisi, did not acquire the bifacial technology, on 220 the contrary of those who settled 300 ka later in Ubeidiya, reinforcing the idea of episodic 221 settlements during that period even though the Southern Caucasus area was repeatedly 222 223 occupied during the Olduvai subchron (Ferring et al., 2011).

224 Between Dmanisi and Ubeidyia, towards west, the Kocabas skull was found in the upper part 225 of a long travertine sequence with a large late Villafranchian mammal assemblage. This

formation is stratigraphically between two fluviatile levels dated by ²⁶Al/¹⁰Be burial method to 1.1-1.6 Ma. The Upper fossileferous travertine shows a reversed polarity that becomes normal above but made on the basis of stratigraphic correlations suggesting a possible Cobb Mountain but most probably Jaramillo event at the top of the sequence if no stratigraphic gap occurred between both sections (Lebatard et al., 2014). This old sequence in Turkey containing one human skull associated with a lot of other faunal remains strengthens the idea that the Levantine corridor is the most probable African gate exit for Eurasia.

In Western Europe and particularly in Spain, some prehistoric sites such as Atapuerca 233 234 Elefante and Dolina in the northern part, and others like Fuente Nueva 3 and Barranco Leon in Andalucia, have yielded human remains associated with large faunal assemblages and 235 lithic artefacts indicating human presence before 1 Ma. Among these sites, three are dated 236 to 1.4-1.1 Ma corresponding to the first human occurrence in Western Europe (Carbonell et 237 al., 2008; Toro Moyano et al., 2013). They are dated either by methods such as cosmogenic 238 239 and ESR and also by the association of biochronologic and palaeomagnetic data. The last two 240 methods represent the major part of the chronological framework established according to the presence of some rodents such as Allophaiomys lavocati recorded together in Fuente 241 Nueva 3 and Barranco Leon and in the lower level of the Sima del Elefante, TE9, 242 strengthening the idea of a pre-Jaramillo period (Garcia et al., 2014). The 243 244 Matuyama/Brunhes boundary is observed at Sima del Elefante between levels TE16 and TE17 (Pares et al., 2006) and corroborated by reliable OSL dates ranging between 724 and 245 864 ka (Arnold et al., 2015). These data provide a firm minimum age of 0.8 Ma to the human 246 remains found in the lower TE9 level dated by ²⁶Al/¹⁰Be nuclides to 1.1-1.3 Ma and by 247 micromammal faunal assemblage (Carbonell et al., 2008; Cuenca-Bescos et al., 2013) and 248 though the Jaramillo event was not found because of the probable discontinuous nature of 249 250 such an infilling.

The fourth, Atapuerca Gran Dolina, has yielded more than 150 human remains (Homo 251 antecessor) associated with a number of lithic tools and a large macrofaunal assemblage in a 252 253 reliable stratigraphic context, dated to 0.8-0.9 Ma by combined ESR and U-series on herbivorous teeth and by luminescence and ESR on feldspar and quartz for the 2m thick TD6 254 horizon. These data are constrained by a clear reversed to normal polarity change in TD7 255 256 layer above the TD6 level, attributed to Brunhes-Matuyama boundary (Pares and Perez-Gonzalez, 1995; Falguères et al., 1999; Berger et al., 2008; Arnold et al., 2015; Moreno et al., 257 2015). This multi-method and multi-proxy approach makes of Gran Dolina the best-dated 258 259 European site for the Early-Middle Pleistocene period and represents a remarkable point of 260 reference for the chronology of European human evolution.

Other sites in France (Vallonnet, Pont-de-Lavaud, Bois-de-Riquet), in Italy (Monte Poggiolo, 261 Pirro Nord), in Russia (Rodniki/Bogatyri/Kermek), exhibit faunal and/or lithic assemblages as 262 evidence of an early human presence before or around 1 Ma. The chronology of Pirro Nord 263 264 remains unclear ranging between 1.6-1.3 Ma by biochronology to 1 Ma by radiometric 265 methods (unpublished results) showing the difficulties to date such a sedimentary infilling fissure. Bogatyri and Kermek sites are dated to the Early Pleistocene by a combination of 266 geologic, biochronologic and paleomagnetic data but without dating methods (Shchelinsky 267 et al., 2016). Other sites like Vallparadis and Barranc de la Boella in Spain and Kozarnika in 268 269 Bulgaria, and Gesher Benot Ya'agov (GBY) in Israel, belong to a period which can be constrained between 1 and 0.8 Ma. The first mentioned is dated by a combination of 270 palaeomagnetic (reversed period) and biostratigraphic data correlated with a biozone 271 272 defined at Atapueca Dolina between 600 and 800 ka (Cuenca Bescos et al., 2010). ESR-US age obtained on two herbivorous teeth and ESR ages obtained on quartz ranging between 273 274 0.8 and 0.9 Ma are in agreement with the previous data (Duval et al., 2012; 2015). La Boella 275 located in Catalunia has provided a data set based on palaeomagnetic and cosmogenic

analyses and palaeontologic assemblage by stratigraphic correlations of three sections. 276 These data place the site at ca 1 Ma as one of the oldest Early Acheulean European sites 277 278 even though no transition between Mode 1 and Mode 2 was clearly found (Mosquera et al., 279 2016). Kozarnika site has a long stratigraphic sequence in which an impressive faunal assemblage was found, is dated to 1.5 to 0.5 Ma (Sirakov et al., 2010). A recent 280 palaeomagnetic study has reduced the duration of the sequence to the Middle Pleistocene 281 period with the base of the infilling beginning with the Brunhes-Matuyama boundary at 0.78 282 Ma (Muttoni et al., 2017). GBY has yielded important environmental and cultural data in a 283 284 chronostratigraphical framework bracketed by Ar/Ar dates and documented by magnetostratigraphic data, highlighting important climatic changes around the 285 Brunhes/Matuyama boundary (Goren-Inbar et al., 2000; Proborukmi et al., 2018). After 286 Ubeidiya at 1.4 Ma, another wave with biface technology leaves Africa at 800 ka. 287

The archaeological sequence of Vallonnet site lies between two flowstones recently dated by 288 289 U-Pb methods and correlated with palaeomagnetic results providing an age range older than 290 the Jaramillo event around 1.2-1.1 Ma (Michel et al., 2017). However, the limited number of palaeomagnetic samples plus the similar ages obtained on both upper and lower calcitic 291 formations do not support such a temporal resolution allowing an identification of a 292 palaeomagnetic event of less than 30 ka duration. At Pont-de-Lavaud site, Creuse valley, a 293 294 prehistoric settlement is attested by several archaeological pavements and numerous artefacts of archaic lithic industry (Mode 1). The fossil fluvial terrace at +90m (up to the 295 present-day floodplain) in which the site was recovered, is dated by ESR applied on quartz to 296 297 1.1 Ma with an error range which does not allow a firm attribution to a pre Jaramillo period. But the dates are made in a regional context providing to the Middle Creuse valley with a 298 fluvial history from the highest terrace dated to 1.8 Ma suggesting the beginning of the 299 300 valley incision to the youngest fluvial formations (at +15-25m) dated to 200-300 ka in which

bifaces were found (Voinchet et al., 2010). The chronology of the site of Bois-de-Riquet, at Lézignan-la-Cèbe, was discussed before the recent excavations allowed a better knowledge of the stratigraphic relation between the basalt dated to 1.57 Ma and the archaeological units deposited in a locus formed after a thermal retraction of the basalt at the end of the cooling phase. A small rodent assemblage yields an age ranging between 1.0 and 0.9 Ma based on the overlap of the biostratigraphic range of arvicoline species and compared with those found in other old European sites (Lozano-Fernandez et al., 2019).

The site of Happisburgh in England, thanks to a weak reversed polarity of the sediments and in spite of a strong normal polarity overprint due to iron mineral (greigite), and a rich documentation of fossil plants and vertebrate assemblage, demonstrates also that Early Hominins settled at latitude higher than 50° in northern Europe, at 1.0-0.8 Ma during a fully temperate climatic episode (Parfitt et al., 2010).

Today, the « key-fossils » contributing to the knowledge of human evolution in Western 313 314 Europe are the oldest fossils found at Elefante and Barranco Leon, which are too 315 fragmentary to be classified, Homo antecessor, Homo heidelbergensis, Ното neandertalensis and Homo sapiens (Stringer, 2012). One of the major paleoanthropological 316 issues is to establish whether or not there is a phyletic relationship between the oldest 317 fossils and Homo antecessor whose age, well constrained at Gran Dolina, Atapuerca, is older 318 319 than 0.8 Ma and likely younger than 1 Ma belonging to the end of Early Pleistocene period (Bermudez de Castro et al., 1997). According to the Spanish authors, Homo antecessor and 320 the European fossils were close to the African contemporaneous branch. This is the only one 321 fossil that is well dated since the Dmanisi human remains and both are separated from 1 Ma. 322 Today, the paucity of European human remains older than 1 Ma precludes a thorough 323 324 comparative study between these fossils.

325

Another important chronological gap of about 150-200 ka exists between the human fossils 327 of TD6 Gran Dolina and H. heidelbergensis (Stringer, 2012). In other words, no fossil was 328 329 found between 800 and 650 ka in Europe. The holotype mandible of Mauer has a reliable chronological framework provided by independent methods for which results of 0.6 Ma are 330 in agreement, and corroborated by faunal arguments (Wagner et al., 2010). No lithic 331 artifacts were found in the site. The Mauer mandible is coeval with the decidual human 332 tooth unearthed from an archaeological layer at Isernia la Pineta, Italy, constrained with 333 accuracy by ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar analyses to 583-561 ka (Peretto et al., 2015), and with the human 334 femur of Notarchirico constrained between 670 and 610 ka (Pereira et al., 2015). In both 335 cases, ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar single crystal laser fusion was applied to sanidines extracted from reworked 336 volcanic effluents for Isernia layers and for which results are presented as probability 337 diagrams on 4 units (Deino and Potts, 1990). For the U3 fluvial unit overlying the 338 339 archaeological layer, a wide range of age is obtained from 709 to 576 ka. The youngest sanidine ages are the same than that of the basal calcareous tufa which is considered as a 340 maximum age for the human remain (weighted mean age of 586 ± 1 ka). Isernia has yielded 341 a great quantity of faunal remains similar to those found at Mauer, and has provided a large 342 lithic assemblage without bifaces but documenting significant technical innovations of the 343 344 Early Acheulean in Europe (Gallotti and Peretto, 2015). In Notarchirico, the comparison of ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar ages with TL and ESR results on bleached quartz are in agreement and place the 345 sequence between 670 and 614 ka. Bifaces associated with the hominin femur represent 346 347 one of the oldest Acheulean assemblages in the southern part of Western Europe. These human fossils are contemporaneous with the marine isotope stage (MIS) 15 with concordant 348 ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar ages at the two sigma limit and with reliable Luminescence and ESR ages with one 349 350 sigma error range for Mauer and Notarchiricho but not for Isernia which gave younger ESR-

US ages because of the difficulty to build the geochemical history of the t3 layer which consists in a dense bones accumulation with high uranium content due to the volcanic environment (Falguères et al., 2007; Shao et al., 2011). The apparent older introduction of Bifaces in Europe than the current chronological framework of *Homo heidelbergensis* questions about either the real older origins of that fossil or about another species bringing with it the Acheulian culture. Is the Mauer mandible representative as a *Homo heidelbergensis* holotype as written by Hublin in 2009?

The first Acheulean evidence with Large Cutting tools assemblages (LCTs) like bifaces, 358 cleavers and other large flakes, emerged in several European sites at c. 600-800 ka. The 359 oldest sites yielding handaxes appear simultaneously in Central France such as La Noira 360 dated to around 650-700ka (Moncel et al., 2013) and in southern Italy at Notarchirico 361 between 610 and 670 ka as mentioned previously, and a climatic stage later in the lowest 362 levels of Arago cave, France (Falguères et al., 2015). La Noira did not yield any faunal 363 364 remains because of the acidic deposits. So, the ESR method was applied to optically bleached quartz grains on the fluvial sequence providing a weighted mean age of 665 ± 55 ka 365 (Despriée et al., 2017). An age of 730 \pm 210 ka was obtained by ²⁶Al/¹⁰Be on quartz coming 366 from the unit containing the lithic artefacts at the base of the stratigraphy (Shen et al., 367 2012). The large error range is essentially due to the relatively high aluminium content in the 368 369 sediment. The result was proposed as preliminary one.

Several sites have yielded human remains that began to acquire Neandertalian features. Arago cave exhibits a thick archaeological sequence constituted by three stratigraphical complexes (Lumley de et al., 1984). Cold and arid conditions are observed at the base of the Middle Stratigraphical Complex, in levels in which human remains associated with lithic artifacts among them large handaxes, were found. This level (P/Q level) was recently dated to 550 ka by combined ESR/U-Th and associated with the MIS14 in agreement with the fauna found such as *Ovis ammon antiqua* and *Rangifer tarandus* indicating a cold climate.
The top of the Middle Complex has provided more than 100 human remains in the G level
for which a mean age of 440 ka suggests a development of this level during a cold stage
(MIS12), at least at the base of the level (Falguères et al., 2004; 2015; Han et al., 2010).
These fossils have been classified as *Homo erectus Tautavelensis*, showing affinities with
Middle Pleistocene *Homo erectus* of Africa and Asia (Lumley de, 2015).

Another key-site for Middle Pleistocene period is La Sima de los Huesos, Atapuerca, Spain. 382 The Hominin-bearing layer that yielded thousands of human remains was reassigned to a 383 384 minimum age of 430 ka by using a multi-method approach (Arsuaga et al., 2014). A calcite raft taken directly on human skull has yielded and age of 434 +36 / -24 ka. Quartz grains 385 were dated by TT-OSL and pIR-IR provided an age range of 428 to 441 for feldspar and f 396 386 387 to 429 ka for quartz. A ESR age of 443 \pm 90 ka was obtained on quartz. Some much older age was obtained by ESR underlining the bad conditions of quartz bleaching in karstic sediments. 388 389 The contemporaneity between the age of Arago (G level) and that of SH fossils does not fit 390 well with their evolution degree in terms of neandertal apomorphies and raises the issue of one or two coeval human species. We find the same type of comparison in Africa with 391 Kabwe skull recently dated by U-series (LA-MC-ICPMS, TIMS, Gamma-spectrometry) directly 392 on the skull and bones and on calcitic crust yielding an age of 300 ka (Grün et al., 2020), 393 394 similar to that obtained on Jebel Irhoud human remains (Richter et al., 2017) though they are morphologically different. 395

The Acheulean technology becomes standardized in many European sites at 300-400 ka with some essential evolution steps like the arrival of Levallois technique and fire control, and disappears at the end of Middle Pleistocene (ca 130 ka).

399

400 4/ The southern part of the Mediterranean Basin

401 When we look at the southern side of the Mediterranean Sea, in Northern Africa, Aïn Hanech site in Algeria has provided the oldest lithic artifacts from Maghreb probably at 1.7-402 403 1.9 Ma and recently Oldowan stone artifacts and cut-marked bones excavated from two nearby deposits at Ain Boucherit were estimated to 1.9 Ma to 2.4 Ma (Sahnouni et al., 2018). 404 The age range was obtained by magnetostratigraphic, Electron Spin Resonance, and 405 406 mammalian biochronologic data. This raises the possibility that the Gibraltar strait was an eventual gateway for peopling Europe before 1.0 Ma (Bar-Yosef and Belfer Cohen, 2001; 407 Pares et al., 2013). Thomas Quarry, Morocco, yielded also a rich Acheulean lithic assemblage 408 409 including bifaces in level L1 which could be older than 1 Ma according to the faunal assemblage and taking into account the reversed polarity magnetostratigraphy observed in 410 the sediments (Raynal et al., 2001; Gallotti et al., 2020). 411

In the same early Middle Pleistocene shoreline of the Oulad Hamida Formation, the "Grotte 412 413 des Rhinoceros" has yielded the earliest evidence of human consumption and carcass 414 processing at 700 ka in Acheulean context in a cave for North Africa (Daujeard et al., 2020). Combined ESR/U-series ages were obtained on herbivorous teeth and gave a range 415 comprised between 690-720 ka and 520-550 ka from the base to the top of the 416 archaeological sequence. The faunal assemblage appears to be younger than that of 417 Tighennif, Algeria, but older than 500 ka by comparison with early Pleistocene extinct taxa 418 419 and in agreement with radiometric dates. Tighennif has provided a human mandible associated with a large faunal assemblage placing the site at the Brunhes-Matuyama 420 boundary and making of this site one of the best reference for Middle Pleistocene in North-421 422 Africa (Geraads, 2010).

423 It is clear from the above that further development of dating methods and multi-proxies424 and/or multi-method approaches are critical to improving the chronology of this evidence of

425 early human occupation and to highlight dispersal continuity or discontinuity, and better426 understand the routes by which our ancestors dispersed by Africa.

427

428 **6/ Conclusions**

Figure 1 suggests that several possible paths could have been taken by the first hominins to 429 430 reach Western Europe between 1.8 and 1.0 Ma and the main terrestrial way is the Levantine corridor giving an access to Europe by Turkey or by the northern shores of the Black Sea. We 431 cannot forget that the Gibraltar strait offers an opportunity for hominins to cross from Africa 432 433 to Europe in spite of all the difficulties inherent in the strength of the currents and to the distance to cross and though no evidence in terms of megafauna nor lithic assemblage 434 allows one to support such a crossing. A similitude between specific large flake Acheulean 435 techniques observed at Tighenif, Algeria and present in some Spanish sites would support a 436 North-African origin for the Acheulean in Spain (Sharon, 2011). The comparison between 437 438 the human fossils found at Thomas Quarry, Morocco, Tighenif, Algeria and those found at 439 Atapuerca, for instance, would certainly provide a number of valuable information on the eventual morphological affinities between these hominins at the end of Early Pleistocene 440 and on their filiation. The exceptional richness of Early Pleistocene sites in Spain for this 441 period (4 sites older than 0.8 Ma) could be an argument in favor of an early peopling of the 442 Iberian Peninsula by Gibraltar. 443

The Turkish path is probably the easiest route to take from Africa to Europe. Turkey offers a potential of sites such as Kocabas and probably many others yet to be discovered even though currently only Middle Pleistocene sites are known like Yarimburgaz (Howell et al., 1996). On the other bank of the Bosphorus, Kozarnika, Rodniki Bogatyri and Kermek sites are witnesses of another possible path north to Black Sea.

Again it can be argued that radiometric dates, compared with palaeomagnetic and biostratigraphic data, added to faunal constraints due to climatic and environmental changes with dates for the first or the last occurrence of species, are vital to reconstruct the chronological framework of human evolution in Europe. On the other hand, the nature and heterogeneity of archaeological sequences often perturbed by posterior events (draining phenomena, diagenetic processes) and discontinuous sedimentation process render difficult the interpretation of paleomagnetic data.

The first presence of hominins without bifaces is observed at Dmanisi and Aïn Boucherit/Aïn 456 Hanech at more than 1.5 Ma. Another "wave" of settlements shows that Levantine and 457 African sites like Ubeidiya and Thomas Quarry have bifaces at a period ranging between 1.4 458 to 1.0 Ma while their contemporaneous western European sites like Pirro Nord, Barranco 459 460 Leon, Elefante or Pond-de-Lavaud show a Mode 1 industry. The Acheulean handaxe industries appear in Western Europe around 0.7 Ma suggesting that the technique was used 461 before the emergence of Homo heidelbergensis, though the scarcity of human remains in 462 Europe between 1.5 and 0.6 Ma emphasizes the difficulties in understanding human 463 464 evolution and behavior. So, before the arrival of Acheulean assemblages around 600-700 ka, it seems difficult to consider a continuity of peopling Europe. Probably the scarce first 465 466 settlements that reached Europe and particularly in the Iberian peninsula did not succeed in 467 terms of demography to provide a stable and a continuous human peopling. When looking at the range dates at figure 4 and table 1, Hominins settled in Europe before 1 Ma in the 468 Mediterranean basin. The knowledge of the oldest wave of human arrivals, after that of 469 Dmanisi, still remains fragmentary since the only human remains belonging to this first 470 471 implantation come from sites in Spain and at Ubeidyia and Kocabas.

472 Currently, only three sites in Spain one in England and one in France are coeval with the end473 of the Lower Pleistocene. The high altitude (around 1000m) for the TD6 and the latitude

higher than 50° for Happisburgh suggest that the human occupations settled during 474 temperate and humid phases while controlled fire was not yet present. The Middle 475 476 Pleistocene period was marked by a succession of cold periods with severe climate 477 interspersed by shorter temperate and humid episodes. These contrasts contributed mainly in the hominin settlements of Western Europe from 800 to 130 ka (Denell et al., 2011). From 478 this point of view, *Homo antecessor*, found in a well constrained stratigraphy associated with 479 large faunal and lithic assemblages, is of paramount importance because it represents the 480 only human fossil making a link between the first waves of settlement and the people who 481 brought bifacial culture to Europe. 482

483

Acknowledgements: My first thoughts go to Yuji Yokoyama who settled a dating Lab in the 484 Department of prehistory of Paris, long time ago and contributed actively to the 485 pluridisciplinary approach in Prehistory recommended by H. de Lumley. I would like to thank 486 487 warmly my closest colleagues J.J. Bahain, P. Voinchet and O. Tombret with whom I share samples, machines, and coffee. I thank also all the students who made their Phd in our lab 488 hoping they learned something with us. I began my carreer as geochronologist at Atapuerca 489 and I would like to thank warmly E. Carbonell, J.M. Bermudez de Castro and J.L. Arsuaga, and 490 also all the Atapuerca teams, for trusting me and providing access and samples of such 491 492 prestigious sites. My thanks go to D. Sanderson and M. Caparros who greatly contributed to improve the language of the article. I thank the anonymous reviewer who contributed to 493 improve this paper. 494

495

496	Figure caption
497	Figure 1: The main possible paths for peopling Western Europe from Africa between 1.8 and
498	0.8 Ma. The sites in blue contain human remains.
499	
500	Figure 2: The main dating methods used in Prehistory and their range of application. The
501	grey areas correspond to a normal polarity (+) while the white parts are reversed polarity (-).
502	H.H. is Homo Heidelbergensis.
503	
504	Figure 3: Large Cutting Tools, LCT, classified as Acheulean industry from La Noira site found
505	in layer dated older than 650 ka (Moncel et al., 2013).
506	
507	Figure 4: Chronology of the main sites with their age range (in green, sites with human
508	remains) versus palaeomagnetic data, marine oxygen isotopes (Lisiecki and Raymo, 2005).
509	The oldest sites in Europe appear at around 1.4 Ma. Sites in green have human remains and
510	those with a star have bifaces.
511	
512	
513	Table 1: The oldest sites in Europe and Northern Africa (Mediterranean Basin) presented
514	with radiometric, biochronologic and palaeomagnetic data, and the relevant references.
515	B/M corresponds to Brunhes/Matuyama, M/G to Matuyama/Gauss and O to Olduvai.
516	

518 References

Arnold, L.J., Demuro, M., Pares, J.M., Perez-Gonzalez, A., Arsuaga, J.L., Bermúdez de Castro,
J.M., Carbonell, E. 2015. Evaluating the suitability of extended-range luminescence dating
techniques over Early and Middle Pleistocene timescales: Published datasets and case
studies from Atapuerca, Spain. Quaternary International, 389, 167-190.

523

Arsuaga, J.L., Martinez, I., Arnold, L.J., Aranburu, A., Gracia-Téllez, A., Sharp, W.D., Quam,
R.M., Falguères, C., Pantonja-Pérez, A., Bischoff, J.L., Poza-Rey, E., Parés, J.M., Carretero,
J.M., Demuro, M., Lorenzo, C., Sala, N., Martinon-Torres, M., Garcia, N., Alcazar de Velasco,
A., Cuenca-Bescos, G., Gomez-Olivencia, A., Moreno, D., Pablos, A., Shen, C.C., Rodriguez, L.,
Ortega, A.I., Garcia, R., Bonmati, A., Bermudez de Castro, J.M., Carbonell, E. 2014.
Neandertal roots: cranial and chronological evidence from Sima de los Huesos. Science, 344,

530 1358-1363.

Arzarello, M., Marcolini, F., Pavia, G., Pavia, M., Petronio, C., Petrucci, M., Rook, L., Sardella,
R. 2007. Evidence of earliest human occurrence in Europe: the site of Pirro Nord (southern
Italy). Naturwissenschaften, 94, 107-112.

534

Arzarello, M., De Weyer, L., Peretto, C. 2016. The first European peopling and the Italian
case: Peculiarities and "opportunism". Quaternary International, 393, 41-50.

Ashton, N., Lewis, S.G., De Groote, I., Duffy, S.M., Bates, M., Bates, R., Hoare, P., Lewis, M.,
Parfitt, S.A., Peglar, S., Williams, C., Stringer, C. 2014. Hominin footprints from Early
Pleistocene deposits at Happisburgh, UK. Plos One, 9, e88329.

541

Bajo, P., Drysdale, R., Woodhead, J., Hellstrom, J., Zanchetta, G. 2012. High-resolution U-Pb
dating of an Early Pleistocene stalagmite from Corchia Cave (Central Italy). Quaternary
Geochronology, 14, 5-17.

545
546 Bar-Yosef, O., Goren-Inbar, N. 1993. The Lithic Assemblages of Ubeidiya, a Lower Paleolithic
547 Site in the Jordan Valley. The Institute of Archaeology, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem,
548 Jerusalem.

549

550 Bar-Yosef, O., Belfer-Cohen, A. 2001. From Africa to Eurasia- Early dispersals. Quaternary 551 International, 75, 19-28.

552

Belmaker, M., Tchernov, E., Condemi, S., Bar-Yosef, O. 2002. New evidence for hominid
presence in the Lower Pleistocene of the Southern Levant. Journal of Human Evolution, 43,
43-56.

556
557 Berger, G.W., Pérez-González, A., Carbonell, E., Arsuaga, JL., Bermúdez de Castro, J.M., Ku,
558 T.L. 2008. Luminescence chronology of cave sediments at the Atapuerca
559 palaeoanthropological site, Spain. Journal of Human Evolution, 55, 300-311.

560

Bermúdez de Castro, J.M., Arsuaga, J.L., Carbonell, E., Rosas, A., Martínez, I., Mosquera, M.
1997. A hominid from the Lower Pleistocene of Atapuerca, Spain: possible ancestor to
Neandertals and modern humans. Science 276, 1392-1395.

Carbonell, E., Bermúdez de Castro, J.M., Parés, J.M., Pérez-González, A., Cuenca-Bescós, G.,
Ollé, A., Mosquera, M., Huguet, R., van der Made, J., Rosas, A., Sala, R., Vallverdú, J., García,
N., Granger, D.E., Martinón-Torres, M., Rodríguez, X.P., Stock, G.M., Vergès, J.M., Allué, E.,
Burjachs, F., Cáceres, I., Canals, A., Benito, A., Díez, C., Lozano, M., Mateos, M., Navazo, M.,
Rodríguez, J., Rosell, J., Arsuaga, J.L. 2008. The first hominin of Europe. Nature 452, 465–470.

570 Cuenca-Bescos, G., Rofes, J., Lopez-García, J.M., Blain, H.A., De Marfa, R.J., Galindo571 Pellicena, M.A., Bennasar-Serra, M.L., Melero-Rubio, M., Arsuaga, J.L., Bermúdez de Castro,
572 J.M., Carbonell, E. 2010. Biochronology of Spanish Quaternary small vertebrate faunas.
573 Quaternary International 212, 109-119.

574

575 Cuenca-Bescos, G., Rofes, J., Lopez-García, J.M., Blain, H.-A., Rabal-Garcés, R., Sauqué, V., 576 Arsuaga, J.L., Bermúdez de Castro, J.M., Carbonell, E., 2013. The small mammals of Sima del 577 Elefante (Atapuerca, Spain) and the first entrance of Homo in Western Europe. Quaternary 578 International, 295, 28-35.

579

Daujeard, C., Falguères, C., Shao, Q., Geraads, D., Hublin, J.J., Lefèvre, D., El Graoui, M., Rué,
M., Gallotti, R., Delvigne, V., Queffelec, A., Ben Arous, E., Tombret, O., Mohib, A., Raynal, J.P.
(2020). Earliest African evidence of carcass processing and consumption in cave at 700 ka,

583 Casablanca, Morocco. Scientific Reports, 10, 4761.

584 Deino A, Potts R. 1990. Single-crystal 40Ar/39Ar dating of the Olorgesailie Formation, 585 Southern Kenya Rift. Journal of Geophysical Research 95: 8453–8470.

587 Dennell, R.W., Martinon-Torres, M., Bermudez de Castro, J.M. 2011. Hominin variability, 588 climatic instability and population demography in Middle Pleistocene Europe. Quaternary 589 Science Reviews, 30, 1511-1524.

590

586

591 Despriée, J., Voinchet, P., Courcimault, G., Bahain, J.J., Puaud, S., Moreno, Garcia, D., 592 Chantreau, Y., Tissoux, H., Gallet, X., Chapon-Sao, C., Abdessadok, S., Falguères, C. 2017. Le 593 site du Pléistocène moyen de la Noira à Brinay (Cher, Région Centre, France): contexte 594 morphosédimentaire, géochronologique et données archéologiques. Quaternaire, 28, 31-48. 595

596 Despriée, J., Moncel, M.H., Arzarello, M., Courcimault, G., Voinchet, P., Bahain, J.J., 597 Falguères, C. 2018. The 1-million-year-old quartz assemblage from Pont-de-Lavaud (Centre, 598 France) in the European context. Journal of Quaternary Science, 33, 639-661

599 Di Maida, G., Mannino, M.A., Krause-Kyora, B., Jensen, T.Z.T., Talamo, S. 2019. Radiocarbon 600 dating and isotope analysis on the purported Aurignacian skeletal remains from Fontana 601 Nuova (Ragusa, Italy). Plos One, 1371, 0213173.

602

603

Dodonov, A.E., Trubikhin, V.M., Tesakov, A.S., 2008b. Paleomagnetism of bonebearing
deposits of the site Sinyaya Balka/Bogatyri. In: Early Palaeolithic of Eurasia: new discoveries.
International Conference. Krasnodar – Temriuk, 1–6 September 2008, Rostov-on-Don, 138–
139.

Duval, M., Falguères, C., Bahain, J.J. 2012. Chronology of the oldest hominid settlements in 609 610 Western Europe: contribution of the combined US-ESR dating method applied to fossil teeth from Early Pleistocene Spanish localities. Quaternary Geochronology, 10, 412-417. 611 612 613 Duval, M., Bahain, J.J., Falguères, C., Garcia, J., Guilarte, V., Grün, R., Martinez, K., Moreno, 614 D., Shao, Q., Voinchet, P. 2015. Revisiting the ESR chronology of the Early Pleistocene 615 hominin occupation at Vallparadis (Barcelona, Spain). Quaternary International, 389, 213-616 223. 617 618 Duval M., Falguères, C., Bahain, J.J., Grün, R., Shao, Q., Aubert, M., Dolo, J.M., Agusti, J., 619 Martinez-Navarro, B., Palmquist, P., Toro-Moyano, I. 2012. On the limits of using combined 620 U-series/ESR method to date fossil teeth from two Early Pleistocene archaeological sites of 621 the Orce area (Guadix-Baza basin, Spain). Quaternary Research, 77, 482-491. 622 Duval, M., Grün, R. 2016. Are published ESR dose assessments on fossil tooth enamel 623 624 reliable? Quaternary Geochronology, 31, 19-27. 625 626 Falguères, C., Bahain, J.J, Yokoyama, Y., Arsuaga, J.L., Bermúdez de Castro, J.M., Carbonell, E., Bischoff, J.L, Dolo, J.M. 1999. Earliest humans in Europe: the age of TD6 Gran Dolina, 627 628 Atapuerca, Spain. Journal of Human evolution, 37, 343-352. 629 Falguères, C., Yokoyama, Y., Shen, G., Bischoff, J.L., Ku, T.L., Lumley, H. de 2004. New U-630 series dates at the Caune de l'Arago, France. Journal of Archaeological Science, 31, 941-952. 631 632 Falguères, C., Bahain, J.J., Dolo, J.M., Mercier, N., Valladas, H. 2007. On the interest and the 633 634 limits of using combined ESR/U-series model in the case of very late uranium uptake. 635 Quaternary Geochronology, 2, 403–408. 636 Falguères, C., Bahain, J.J., Duval, M., Shao, Q., Han, F., Lebon, M., Mercier, N., Perez-637 638 Gonzalez, A., Dolo, J.M., Garcia, T. 2010. A 300-600 ka ESR/U-series chronology of Acheulian sites in Western Europe. Quaternary International. 223-224, 293-298. 639 640 Falguères, C., Shao, Q., Han, F., Bahain, J.J., Richard, M., Perrenoud, C., Moigne, A.M., 641 642 Lumley, H. de 2015. New ESR and U-series dating at Caune de l'Arago, France: a key-site for European Middle Pleistocene. Quaternary Geochronology, 30, 547-553. 643 Ferring, R., Oms, O., Agustí, J., Berna, F., Nioradze, M., Shelia, T., Tappen, M., Vekua, A., 644 Zhvania, D., Lordkipanidze, D. 2011. Earliest human occupations at Dmanisi (Georgian 645 Caucasus) dated to 1.85–1.78 Ma. PNAS, 108, 26, 10432-10436. 646 647 648 Gabunia, L., Vekua, A., Lordkipanidze, D., Swisher, C.C., Ferring, R., Justus, A., Nioradze, M., 649 Tvalchrelidze, M., Anton, S.C., Bosinski, G., Jöris, O., Lumley, M.A. de, Majsuradze, G., 650 651 Mouskhelishvili, A. 2000. Earliest Pleistocene Hominid cranial remains from Dmanisi, 652 Republic of Georgia: Taxonomy, geological setting, and age. Science, 288, 1019-1025. 653 654 Gagnepain, J., Laurent, M., Bahain, J.J., Falguères, C., Hedley, I., Peretto, C., Wagner, J.J., 655 Yokoyama, Y. 1998. Synthèse des données paléomagnétiques et radiochronologiques du site 656 de Ca'Belvedere di Monte Poggiolo (Romagne, Italie) et de son environnement géologique. 657 Actes du XIIIe Congrès UISPP, Forli, vol. 6, tome II, 877-888. 658 659 Gallotti, R., Mohib, A., Fernandez, P., El Graoui, M., Lefèvre, D., Raynal, J.P. 2020. Dedicated 660 core-on-anvil production of bladelet-like flakes in the Acheulean at Thomas Quarry I-L1 661 (Casablanca, Morocco). Scientific Reports, 10/ 9225. 662 663 Gallotti, R., Peretto C. 2015. The Lower/early Middle PLeistocene small debitage production in Western Europe: New datat from Isernia la Pineta t.3c (Upper Volturno Basin, Italy). 664 665 Quaternary International, 357, 264-281. 666 Garcia, T., Féraud, G., Falguères, C., Lumley, de H., Perrenoud, C., Lordkipanidze, D. 2010. 667 Earliest human remains in Eurasia: new ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar dating of the Dmanisi hominid-bearing 668 levels, Georgia. Quaternary Geochronology, 5, 443-451. 669 670 671 García, J., Martinez, K., Cuenca-Bescos, G., Carbonell, E. 2014. Human occupation of Iberia 672 prior to the Jaramillo magnetochron (> 1.07 Myr). Quaternary Science Reviews 98, 84-99. 673 674 Geraads, D., Hublin, J.J., Jaeger, J.J., 1986. The Pleistocene hominid site of Ternifine Algeria: 675 new results on the environment, age, and human industries. Quaternary Research, 25, 380-676 386. 677 678 Geraads, D., 2010. Biochronologie mammalienne du Quaternaire du Maroc atlantique, dans 679 son cadre régional. L'Anthropologie, 114, 324-340. 680 681 Goren-Inbar, N., Feibl, C.S., Verosub, K.L., Melamed, Y., Kislev, M.E., Tchernov, E., Saragusti, 682 I. 2000. Pleistocene milestones on the out-of-Africa Corridor at Gesher Benot Ya'aqov, Israel. 683 Science, 289, 944-947. 684 685 Granger, D.E., Muzikar, P.F. 2001. Dating sediment burial with in situ-produced cosmogenic nuclides: theory, techniques, and limitations. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 188, 269-686 687 281. 688 Grün, R., Schwarcz, H.P., Chadam, J.M. 1988. ESR dating of tooth enamel: coupled correction 689 690 for U-uptake and U-series disequilibrium. Nucl. Tracks Radiat. Meas., 14, 237-241. 691 692 Grün, R. 2006. Direct dating of human fossils. Yearbook of Physical Anthropology, 49, 2-48. 693 Grün, R., Joannes-Boyau, R., Stringer, C. 2008. Two types of CO₂ radicals threaten the 694 fundamentals of ESR Dating of tooth enamel. Quaternary Geochronology, 3, 150-172. 695 696 697 Grün, R., Pike, A., McDermott, F., Eggins, S., Mortimer, G., Aubert, M., Kinsley, L., Joannes-Boyau, R., Rumsey, M., Denys, C., Brink, J., Clark, T., Stringer, C. 2020. Dating the skull from 698 Broken Hill, Zambia, and its position in human evolution. Nature, 580, 372-275. 699 700 Han, F., Falguères, C., Bahain, J.J., Shao, Q., Duval, M., Lebon, M., Garcia, T., Dolo, J.M, 701 702 Perrenoud, C., Shen, G.J., Lumley, H. de 2010. Effect of deposit alterations on the dating of 703 herbivorous teeth from Arago cave by the ESR-U series method. Quaternary Geochronology, 704 5, 376-380.

708

710

- Howell, F.C., Arsebük, G., Kuhn, S. 1996. The Middle Pleistocene lithic assemblage from
 Yarimburgaz cave Turkey. Paléorient 22 (1), 31–49.
- Hublin, J.J. (2009). The origin of Neandertals. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA, 106, 16022–16027.

Ingicco, T., van den Bergh, G.D., Jago-on, C., Bahain, J.J., Chacón, M.G., Amano, N., Forestier,
H., King, C., Manalo, K., Nomade, S., Pereira, A., Reyes, M. C., Sémah, A.-M., Shao, Q.,
Voinchet, P., Falguères, C., Albers, P.C.H., Lising, M., Lyras, G., Yurnaldi, D., Rochette, P.,
Bautista, A., de Vos, J. 2018. Earliest known hominin activity in the Philippines by 709
thousand years ago. Nature, 557: 233-237.

- Lebatard, A.E., Alçiçek, M.C., Rochette, P., Khatib, S., Vialet, A., Boulbes, N., Bourlès, D.L., Demory, F., Guipert, G., Mayda, S., Titov, V.V., Vidal, L., Lumley, H. de 2014. Dating the Homo erectus bearing travertine from Kocabas (Denizli, Turkey) at at least 1.1 Ma. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 390, 8-18.
- 720
- Lefèvre, D., Raynal, J.-P., Vernet, G., Kieffer, G., Piperno, M. 2010. Tephro-stratigraphy and
 the age of ancient Southern Italian Acheulean settlements: the sites of Loreto and
 Notarchirico (Venosa, Basilicata, Italy). Quaternary International 223-224, 360-368.
- Lisiecki, L.E., Raymo, M.E. 2005. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed
 benthic d180 records. Paleoceanography 20, PA 1003.
- Lordkipanidze, D., Ponce de León, M.S., Margvelashvili, A., Rak, Y., Rightmire, G.P., Vekua, A.,
 Zollikofer, C.P.E. 2013. A Complete Skull from Dmanisi, Georgia, and the Evolutionary Biology
 of Early Homo. Science, 342, 326-331.
- 729

Lozano-Fernandez, I., Blain, H.A., Agusti, J., Pinero, P., barsky, D., Ivorra, J., Bourguignon, L.
(2019). New clues about the late Early Pleistocene peopling of Western Europe: Small
vertebrates from The Bois-de-Riquet archeopaleontological site (Lézignan-La-Cèbe, southern
France). Quaternary Science Reviews, 219, 187-203.

- 734
- Lumley, H. de, Fournier, A., Park, Y.C., Yokoyama, Y., Demouy, A. 1984. Stratigraphie du
 remplissage pléistocène moyen de la caune de l'Arago à Tautavel. Etude de huit carottages
 effectués de 1981 à 1983. L'Anthropologie, 88, 5-18.
- 738
- Lumley, H. de, Lordkipanidze, D., Féraud, G., Garcia, T., Perrenoud, C., Falguères, C.,
 Gagnepain, J., Saos, T., Voinchet, P. 2002. Datation par la méthode ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar de la couche de
 cendres volcaniques (couche VI) de Dmanissi (Géorgie) qui a livré des restes d'hominidés
 fossiles de 1,81 Ma. Comptes-Rendus Palevol, Paris, 1, 181-189.
- 744
- Lumley, de, M.A. 2015. L'homme de Tautavel. Un *Homo erectus* européen évolué. *Homo erectus tautavelensis*. L'Anthropologie, 119, 202-348.
- 747
- McDonald, K., Martinez-Torres, M., Dennell, R.W., Bermúdez de Castro, J.M. 2012. Discontinuity in the record for hominin occupation in south-western Europe: Implications for occupation of the middle latitudes of Europe. Quaternary International 271, 84-97.
- 751

- Martínez, K., Garcia, J., Carbonell, E., Agustí, J., Bahain, J.J., Blain, H.A., Burjachs, F., Cáceres,
 I., Duval, M., Falguères, C., Gómez, M., Huguet, R. 2010. A new Lower Pleistocene
 archeological site in Europe (Vallparadís, Barcelona, Spain). PNAS, 107, 5762-5767.
- 755

Michel, V., Shen, C.C., Woodhead, J., Hu, H.M., Wu, C.C., Moulle, P.E., Khatib, S., Cauche, D.,
Moncel, M.H., Valensi, P., Chou, Y.M., Gallet, S., Echassoux, A., Orange, F., Lumley, H. de
2017. New dating evidence of the early presence of hominins in Southern Europe. Scientific
Reports, 7, 10074.

- 760
- 761 Moncel, M.H., Despriée, J., Voinchet, P., Tissoux, H., Moreno, D., Bahain, J.J., Courcimault,
- 762 G., Falguères, C. 2013. Early evidence of Acheulean settlement in Northwestern Europe La
- Noira Site, a 700 000 year-old occupation in the Center of France. Plos One, 8, e75529.
- 764 Moreno, D., Falguères, C., Perez-Gonzalez, A., Voinchet, P., Ghaleb, B., Despriée, J., Bahain,
- J.J., Sala, R., Carbonell, E., Bermudez de Castro, J.M., Arsuaga, J.L. 2015. New radiometric dates on the lowest section (TD1 to TD6) of Gran Dolina site (Atapuerca, Spain). Quaternary
- 767 Geochronology, 30, 535-540.
- Mosquera, M., Ollé, A., Rodriguez, X.P. 2013. From Atapuerca to Europe :Tracing the earliest
 peopling of Europe. Quaternary International, 295, 130-137.
- 770 Mosquera, M., Ollé, A., Saladié, P., Cáceres, I., Huguet, R., Villalaín, J., Carrancho, A., Bourlès,
- D., Brauchet, R., Pineda, A., Vallverdù, J. 2016. The Early Acheulean technology of Barranc de
 la Boella (Catalonia, Spain). Quaternary International, 393, 95-111.
- Muttoni, G., Scardia, G., Kent, D.V. 2010. Human migration into Europe during the late Early
 Pleistocene climate transition. Palaeogography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 296, 7993.
- 776
- Muttoni, G., Scardia, G., Kent, D.S., Morsiani, E., Tremolada, F., Cremaschi, M., Peretto, C.
 2011. First dated human occupation of Italy at ~ 0.85 Ma during the late Early PLesitocene
 climate transition. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 307, 241-252.
- 780
- Muttoni, G., Scardia, G., Kent, D.V., Martin, R.A. 2015. Bottleneck at Jaramillo for human
 migration to Iberia and the rest of Europe? Journal of Human Evolution, 80, 187-190.
- Muttoni, G., Sirakov, N., Guadelli, J.L., Kent, D.V., Scardia, G., Monesi, E., Zerboni, A., Ferrara,
 E. 2017. An early Brunhes (<0.78 Ma) age for the Lower Paleolithic tool-bearing Kozarnika
 cave sediments, Bulgaria. Quaternary Science Reviews, 178, 1-13.
- 787
 788 Muttoni, G., Scardia, G., Kent, D.V. 2018. Early hominins in Europe: The Galerian migration
 789 hypothesis. Quaternary Science Reviews, 180, 1-29.
- 790
- Pares, JM., Perez-Gonzalez, A. 1995. Paleomagnetic age for hominid fossils at Atapuerca
 Archaeological site, Spain. Science, 269, 830-832.
- Pares, J.M., Pérez-González, A., Rosas, A., Benito, A., Bermúdez de Castro, J.M., Carbonell, E.,
 Huguet, R., 2006. Matuyama-age lithic tools from the Sima del Elefante site, Atapuerca
 (northern Spain). Journal of Human Evolution, 50, 163-169.

- 797
- Pares, J.M., Duval, M., Arnold, L.J. 2013. New views on an old move : Hominin migration into
 Eurasia. Quaternary International, 295, 5-12.
- 800

Pares, J.M., Alvarez, C., Sier, M., Moreno, D., Duval, M., Woodhead, J.D., Ortega, A.I.,
Campana, I., Rosell, J., Bermudez de Castro, J.M., Carbonell, E. 2018. Chronology of the cave
interior sediments at Gran Dolina archaeological site, Atapuerca (Spain). Quaternary Science
reviews, 186, 1-16.

805

Parfitt, S.A., Ashton, N., Lewis, S.G., Abel, R.L., Coope, G.R., Field, H.F., Gale, R., Hoare, P.G.,
Larkin, N.R., Lewis, M.D., Karloukovski, V., Maher, B.A., Peglar, S.M., Preece, R.C., Whittaker,
J.E., Stringer, C.B. 2010. Early Pleistocene human occupation at the edge of the boreal zone
in northwest Europe. Nature, 466, 229-233.

810

811 Pereira, A., Nomade, S., Voinchet, P., Bahain, J.J., Falguères, C., Garon, H., Lefèvre, D.,

Raynal, J.P., Scao, V., Piperno, M. 2015. The earliest securely dated hominin fossil in Italy and

evidence of Acheulian occupation during glacial MIS 16 at Notarchirico (Venosa, Basilicata,

814 Italy). Journal of Quaternary Science, 30, 639-650.

Peretto, C. 2006. The first peopling of Southern Europe: The Italian case. Comptes RendusPalevol, 5, 283-290.

817

Peretto, C., Arnaud, J., Moggi-Cecchi, J., Manzi, G., Nomade, S., Pereira, A., Falguères, C.,
Bahain, J.J., Grimaud-Hervé, D., Berto, C., Sala, B., Lembo, G., Muttillo, B., Gallotti, R., Thun
Hohenstein, U., Vaccaro, C., Coltorti, M., Arzarello, M. 2015. A human deciduous tooth and
new 40Ar/39Ar dating results from the Middle Pleistocene archaeological site of Isernia la
Pineta, Southern Italy. Plos One, 10.1371, 1-19.

Proborukmi, M.S., Urban, B., Mischke, S., Mienis, H.K., Melamed, Y., Dupont-Nivet, G., Jourdan, F., Goren-Inbar, N.(2018). Evidence for climatic changes around the Matuyama-Brunhes Boundary (MBB) inferred from a multi-proxy palaeoenvironmental study of the GBY#2 core, Jordan river valley, Israel. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 489, 166-185.

Potter, E.K., Stirling, C.H., Andersen, M.B., Halliday, A., N. 2005. High precision Faraday
collectors MC-ICPMS thorium isotope ratio determination. International Journal of Mass
Spectrometry, 247, 10-17.

831

Raynal, J.P., Sbihi Alaoui, F.Z., Geraads, D., Magoga, L., Mohib, A. 2001. Hominid Cave at
Thomas Quarry I (Casablanca, Morocco): Recent findings and their context. Quaternary
International, 223–224, 369-382.

835

Richter, D., Grün, R., Joannes-Boyau, R, Steel, T.E., Amani, F., Rué, M., Fernandes, P., Raynal,
J.P., Geraads, D., Ben-Ncer, A., Hublin, J.J., McPherron, S. 2017. The age of the hominin
fossils from Jebel Irhoud, Morocco, and the origins of the Middle Stone Age. Nature, 546,
293-296.

Roebroeks, W., Villa, P. 2011. On the earliest evidence for habitual use of fire in Europe.
PNAS, 108, 5209-5214.

- Sahnouni, M., Hadjouis, D., van der Made, J., Derradji, A., Canals, A., Medig, M., Belahrech,
 H., Harichane, Z., Rabhi, M. 2004. On the earliest human occupation in North Africa: a
 response to Geraads et al., Journal of Human Evolution, 46, 763-775.
- 846

Sahnouni, M., Pares, J.M., Duval, M., Caceres, I., Harichane, Z., Made van der, J., PerezGonzalez, A., Abdessadok, S., Kandi, N., Derradji, A., Medig, M., Boulagghraif, K., Semaw, S.
2018. 1.9-million- and 2.4-million-year-old artifacts and stone tool-cutmarked bones from
Ain Boucherit, Algeria. Science, 362, 1297-1301.

851

Shao, Q., Bahain, J.J., Falguères, C., Peretto, C., Arzarello, M., Minelli, A., Thun Hohenstein,
U., Dolo, J.M., Garcia, T., Frank, N., Douville, E. (2011). New ESR/U-series data for the early
Middle Pleistocene site of Isernia la Pineta, Italy. Radiation Measurements, 46, 847-852.

- 855
 856 Shao, Q., Bahain, J.J., Falguères, C., Dolo, J.M., Garcia, T. 2012. A new U-uptake model for
 857 combined ESR/U-series dating of tooth enamel. Quaternary Geochronology, 10, 406-411.
- Sharon, G. (2011). Flakes Crossing the Straits? Entame Flakes and Northern Africa-Iberiacontact during the Acheulean. African Archaeological Review 28, 125-140.
- Shchelinsky, V.E., Dodonov, A.E., Baigusheva, V.S., Kulakov, S.A., Simakova, A.N., Tesakov,
 A.S., Titov, V.V. 2010. Early Palaeolithic sites on the Taman Peninsula (Southern Azov Sea
 region, Russia): Bogatyri/Sinyaya Balka and Rodniki. Quaternary International, 223-224, 2835.
- 865

860

- Shen, G., Michel, V., Despriée, J., Han, F., Granger, D. 2012. Datation d'enfouissement par
 ²⁶Al/¹⁰Be et son application préliminaire à des sites du Paléolithique inférieur en Chine et en
 France. L'Anthropologie, 116, 1-11.
- 869
- 870
- 871
- 872

Sirakov, N., Guadelli, J.L., Ivanova, S., Sirakova, S., Boudadi-Maligne, M., Dimitrova, I.,
Fernadez, Ph., Ferrier, C., Guadelli, A., Iordanova, N., Kovatcheva, M., Krumov, I., Leblanc,
J.C., Miteva, V., Popov, V., Spassov, R., Taneva, S., Tsanova, T., 2010. An ancient continuous
human presence in the Balkans and the beginnings of human settlement in western Eurasia:
A Lower Pleistocene example of the Lower Palaeolithic levels in Kozarnika cave (Northwestern Bulgaria). Quaternary International, 223-224, 94-106.

879

Stringer, C. 2012. The status of *Homo heidelbergensis* (Schoentensack, 1908). Evolutionary
Anthropology 21, 101-107.

Toro-Moyano, I., Martínez-Navarro, B., Agustí, J., Souday, C., Bermúdez de Castro, J.M.,
Martinón-Torres, M., Fajardo, B., Duval, M., Falguères, C., Oms, O., Parés, J.M., Anadón, P.,
Julià, R., García-Aguilar, J.M., Moigne, A.M., Patrocinio Espigares, M., Ros-Montoya, S.,
Palmqvist, P. 2013. The oldest human fossil in Europe dated to ca. 1.4 Ma at Orce (Spain).
Journal of Human Evolution, 65, 1-9.

- Verosub, K., Tchernov, E. 1991. Résultats préliminaires de l'étude magnétostratigraphique
 d'une séquence sédimentaire à l'industrie humaine en Israël. In (B. Vandermeersch, Ed.) Les
 premiers peuplements de l'Europe, 237–242. Paris, CNRS.

Voinchet, P., Despriée, J., Tissoux, H., Falguères, C., Bahain, J.J., Gageonnet, R., Dépont, J.,
Dolo, J.M. 2010. ESR chronology of alluvial deposits and first human settlements of the
Middle Loire Basin (Region Centre, France), Quaternary Geochronology, 5, 381-384.

- Wagner, G.A., Krbetschek, M., Degering, M., Bahain, J.J., Shao, Q., Falguères, C., Voinchet, P.,
 Dolo, J.M., Garcia, T., Rightmire, G.P. 2010. Radiometric dating of the type-site for *Homo heidelbergensis* at Mauer, Germany. PNAS, 107, 19726-19730.
- Woodhead, J., Hellstrom, J., Maas, R., Drysdale, R., Zanchetta, G., Devine, P., Taylor, E. 2006.
 U-Pb geochronology of speleothems by MC-ICP-MS. Quaternary Geochronology 1, 208-221.
- Yokoyama, Y., Bibron, R., Falguères, C. 1988. Datation de planchers stalagmitiques de la
 grotte du Vallonnet à Roquebrune-Cap-Martin (Alpes-Maritimes) France, par la méthode de
 la résonance de spin électronique (ESR). L'Anthropologie, 92, 429-436.

Sites	Countries	Layers	Ages (Ma)	Dating Methods	Palaeomagnetism	Biochronology	Human remains	Fauna Lithic artefacts	References
Oriental Mediterranean area		· · · ·				•			
Dmanisi	Georgia	Mashavera Basalt Iayer VI - A1	$\begin{array}{c} 1.85 \pm 0.01 \\ 1.81 \pm 0.05 \end{array}$	⁴⁰ Ar/ ³⁹ Ar ⁴⁰ Ar/ ³⁹ Ar	(+) (+)	Villafranchian	Skulls, mandibles, postcranial	x x	(Gabunia et al., 2000) (Garcia et al., 2010; Lumley et al., 2002; Ferrin
Ubeidiya	Israel	Lake and fluvial sediments	1.8-1.1		(-)		cranial fragments and teeth	x x	(Belmaker et al., 2002; Verosub and Tchernov
Gesher Benot Ya'aqov (GBY)	Israel	Lake sediments	1,20-0,66	⁴⁰ Ar/ ³⁹ Ar	B/M	Micromammals		x x	(Goren-Inbar et al., 2000; Proborukmietal., 20
Kocabas	Turkey	Upper Travertines	1.3-1.1	²⁶ Al/ ¹⁰ Be burial age	(-) and (+)	late Villafranchian	fragmentary skull	x	(Lebatard et al., 2014)
Rodniki/Bogatyri/Kermek	Russia	Breccia			(-)	Early Pleistocene, Early Biharian		x x	Shchelinsky et al., 2010; Dodonov et al., 2008)
Kozarnika	Bulgary	Layers 13-11			(+) / (-)	Middle Villafranchian		x x	(Sirakov et al., 2010; Muttoni et al., 2017)
Western Europe									
Monte Poggiolo	Italy	marine and detritic sediments	> 0.78	ESR quartz	(-)			x	(Gagnepain et al., 1998; Peretto, 2006; Muttor
Pirro Nord	Italy	conglomerated sandy-clay sediments	1.3 - 1.7		(-)	Late Early Pleistocene		x x	(Arzarello et al., 2007; Arzarello et al., 2016)
Pont-de-Lavaud	France	Fluvial deposits	1.1 ± 0.1	ESR quartz	(+)			x	(Despriée et al., 2018)
Vallonnet	France	stalagmitic floor	1.2-1.1	U-Pb, ESR calcite	(+)	Epivillafranchian		x x	(Michel et al., 2017; Yokoyama et al., 1988)
Bois-de-Riquet	France	basalt containing archaeological sediment	1.1-1.4	⁴⁰ Ar/ ³⁹ Ar		arvicolines (1.0-0.9 Ma)		x x	(Lozano-Fernandez et al., 2019)
Happisburgh	United Kingdom	Channel sediments	1.0-0.78		(-)	Early Pleistocene		x x	(Parfitt et al., 2010; Ashton et al., 2014)
Iberic Peninsula									
Barranco Leon	Spain	Sandstones, calcareous silts	1.02-1.73	ESR quartz	(-)	Early Pleistocene	tooth	x x	(Toro Moyano et al., 2013)
Fuente Nueva-3	Spain	Clays and sands	1.2 ± 0.2	ESR-US	(-)	Early Pleistocene		x x	(Duval et al., 2012)
Trinchera Dolina	Spain	TD7	0.78		B/M				(Pares and Perez Gonzalez, 1995)
		TD6	0.78 - 0.86	ESR-US, OSL, TL		Late Early Pleistocene	150 cranial and post cranial re	x x	(Falguères et al., 1999; Arnold et al., 2015; Ber
		TD4-TD3	> 0.86	ESR quartz	(-)			x x	(Moreno et al., 2015)
		TD1	>1.0	ESR quartz	(-)				(Pares et al., 2018)
Trinchera Elefante	Snain	TE9 - TE16	>0.78		R/M	Farly Pleistocene		× ×	(Pares et al. 2006)
Thinking a circulation	Span	TE0	11 12	²⁶ AI/ ¹⁰ Ro burial ago	D/ W	Early Preistocene	mandible and teeth	× ×	(Carbonell et al. 2009)
		115	1.1 - 1.5	Ally be buildinge			manufole and teeth	* *	(Carbonen et al., 2008)
Terrassa, Vallparadis	Spain	10 et 12	0.8	ESR quartz ; ESR-US	(-)	Late Lower Pleistocene		x x	(Martinez et al., 2010; Duval et al., 2015)
La Boella	Spain	Unit II	1.0	²⁶ Al/ ¹⁰ Be burial age	(-)	Late Lower Pleistocene		x x	(Mosquera et al., 2016)
Southern Mediterranean area									
Aïn Boucherit	Algeria	Muddy gravel deposits	1,9-2,4	ESR quartz	M/G, 0	х		x x	(Sahnouni et al., 2018)
Aïn Hanech	Algeria	fine-grained sediments	1.7-1.9		(+)	Early Pleistocene		x x	(Sahnouni et al., 2004)
Tighenif	Algeria	Sandy sediments	0.7		(+)	Early Middle Pleistocene	mandible	x	(Geraads et al., 1986)
Thomas Quarry	Morocco	Llevel	1.0		(-)	Late Lower Pleistorene		x x	(Ravnal et al., 2001)
momus quarry		LICTOR	1.0		17	Late conter i leistotelle		A	(







