



HAL
open science

**COST Action Progress Review at 24 months
(21/09/2022 to 21/09/2024) CA21161: A new ecosystem
of early music studies**

Philippe Vendrix, Rebekah Ahrendt

► **To cite this version:**

Philippe Vendrix, Rebekah Ahrendt. COST Action Progress Review at 24 months (21/09/2022 to 21/09/2024) CA21161: A new ecosystem of early music studies. COST. 2024. hal-04812832

HAL Id: hal-04812832

<https://cnrs.hal.science/hal-04812832v1>

Submitted on 2 Dec 2024

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

COST Action

Progress Review at 24 months

(21/09/2022 to 21/09/2024)

CA21161: A new ecosystem of early music studies

This report is submitted by the Action Rapporteur in fulfilment of the requirements of the rules for COST Action Management, Monitoring and Final Assessment and is confidential to the COST Association and the Management Committee of the Action.

Summaries

The main aim and objective of the Action is to

EarlyMuse intends to chart new paths that will strengthen the unique place of early music in Europe. It will therefore be a matter of confronting the challenges that arise from different vantage points: (1) scientific, (2) educational, (3) structural and professional, (4) economic and societal.

During its first two years the Action progressed the achievement of this as described below

EarlyMuse fostered the development of a geographically inclusive community focused on historical musicology. It addressed topics related to scientific practices (WG Publications), the status of the discipline in higher education and research (WG Education), the modes of deploying shared tools (WG Sources), and the relationships with the field of research-creation (WG Performance). Finally, it aimed to raise awareness within its community about European issues and to consider ways to engage with public policymakers (WG Policies).

Now bringing together 263 members from 39 countries, EarlyMuse has organized its activities around meetings and short scientific missions that have strengthened connections among researchers from diverse backgrounds. These activities have resulted in publications, most of which are freely accessible on EarlyMuse's own website. They have also invited researchers to combine their efforts to engage with other EU initiatives (Creative Europe, European Cloud for Cultural Heritage, Marie Curie Network).

The next two years, 2025 and 2026, will transform the reflections and investigations of 2023 and 2024 into concrete outputs: articles, notes, policy briefs, and reports. There is no real danger, but there is an obligation to remain vigilant in order to listen to as many voices as possible, thereby strengthening collective initiatives to move beyond the fundamentally individualistic conception of the discipline.

The Rapporteur summarised the Action's major outcomes, impacts and successes as follows

I continue to be deeply impressed at the scope, depth, and quality of the thinking that has gone into EarlyMuse.

Novel technologies of inscription have always complicated the relationship between authors and readers. This is especially true of the performing art of music. From the beginnings of western musical notation a millennium ago, to the advent of the printing press (around 1500), to sound recording about a century ago, new technologies of transcription and reproduction brought about means for controlling the effects and purposes of music, even inaugurating a new sense of it as intellectual property. Each was a new medium of its day, and each brought with it new ways for composers, performers, and listeners to interact around musical ideas.

Now the digital domain dominates our encounter with music, exploding notions of genre, history, and ownership in ways that we have yet to fully comprehend. The digital turn can nevertheless help us understand in particular what we call Early Music—that period of musical history in which the notion of a music 'book' in the modern sense was something quite different from what we know today. Digital texts can help us imagine a time before the great collected editions and genre-bound monuments in our libraries, replacing them with layered, dynamic texts that exist (as they did five hundred years ago) in their variants.

Digital tools also help us connect text and context in new ways, immersing music once again in a network of places, objects, people, and ideas that gave it meaning then, and allow us to make meaning from it now. These methods, in brief, are helping us make old music new again, putting the study and practice of music into deeper conversation with each other. The field of musicology confronts these developments in particular ways on account of its unique system of symbolic notation. But no scholar of the period (and no practicing musician) can afford to ignore the possibilities of the digital turn. It is already transforming our work and teaching, through new kinds of archives, new modes of reading and analysis, and through the new pedagogies upon which scholarship and performance will increasingly depend.

The Action Chair has described their plans for addressing issues identified in their report as follows

There is no real danger as such, but constant attention must be paid to ensure geographical balance, the contribution of young researchers, and gender balance. A junior researcher from Croatia has been appointed to inform us on gender equality issues within our action and also beyond, in the professional sector.

The Rapporteur summarised the Actions's plans for addressing issues identified in the report

This seems a good plan for this important work. I have personally been impressed at the wide range of scholars involved in the work.

Achievement of MoU objectives, deliverables and additional outputs/ achievements

MoU objectives

The Action reported progress of the following objectives.

MoU objective	Level of progress	Rapporteur assessment
Analysis of the higher education and scientific landscape of early music: the objective will be to describe and analyse the situation of early music by comparing the academic and non-academic worlds, in Europe. What impulses are modulating this landscape today?	26 - 50%	CONFIRMED
The meaning and strength of early music: its modalities of operation are no longer those of the past decades. Their presence is still affirmed in the academic world. However, the music industries are seeking to offer new models.	26 - 50%	CONFIRMED
Preservation of musical heritage and accessibility to resources: an essential step towards enabling early music to participate in the CCI dynamic is the development and construction of a platform that will enable the richness, diversity and complexity of the early music field to be visible and accessible.	26 - 50%	CONFIRMED
Early music: societal dimension, policy making and business. A two-pronged strategy: first to raise the profile of the field and create awareness of the challenges and opportunities it presents, and second to provide decision makers with the understanding they need to realize the field's potential.	26 - 50%	CONFIRMED
Creating a multidisciplinary research network. The aim is not to exist as an autonomous force, but to coordinate dialogue in order to understand all aspects of the scientific field and its cultural implications.	26 - 50%	CONFIRMED
Scientific dissemination and clustering. The aim is to publish studies that will nourish the public debate while allowing the emergence of new paradigms to address the political dimension of early music, and beyond any form of music through the methodology that will be implemented.	0 - 25%	CONFIRMED
Career and regulations EarlyMuse intends to confront the question of careers. They differ according to the genre, the country and the nature of the profession. It intends to work on the place of women, the professional potential of new graduates.	26 - 50%	CONFIRMED

Rapporteur assessment of the level of progress reported by the Action.

The Rapporteur confirmed the level of progress reported by the Action for all objectives.

Action explanation regarding MoU objectives reported as 25% or less achieved

The table below shows the Action's explanation and the Rapporteur's analysis thereof for any MoU objectives that the Action reported as 25% or less achieved.

MoU Objective that was reported as	Action's explanation	Rapporteur's analysis
------------------------------------	----------------------	-----------------------

25% or less achieved		
<p>Scientific dissemination and clustering. The aim is to publish studies that will nourish the public debate while allowing the emergence of new paradigms to address the political dimension of early music, and beyond any form of music through the methodology that will be implemented.</p>	<p>The publication of joint works first required a phase of network facilitation. By the end of the second year, EarlyMuse had indeed published an article in an international journal and made numerous reports available as open access on its website. However, it was only during the most recent meetings that the network's potential and the necessity to work prospectively for the future of the disciplinary field became clear.</p>	<p>Based on the paper cited, the WG seems to be making solid progress, in my view. The institutional and practical aspects of this WG are no less complex than the musical scores that are the object of publication in the first place. The Zagreb and Malaga meetings were clearly productive, and I expect that a platform of best practices will be shared with stakeholders (publishers, libraries, cultural institutions, scholars and performers) in the months ahead. I have no concerns.</p>

General Assessment of MoU objectives

The level of ambition of the MoU objectives is **High**.
Overall, **all MoU Objectives are progressing appropriately**.

Deliverables

The table below shows, for each deliverable, the delivery status reported by the Action and the Rapporteur's comment.

Deliverable	Month deliverable due	Delivery status	Rapporteur Comment
Repprt on the structure and nature of early music education in conservatories and universities.	48	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	The team responsible for this work is well qualified, and in my view is making good progress towards the goal. It is important to understand the vast range of institutions they are attempting to survey. I am confident of their success.
Analysis (report) of target collections, analyzing benefits of cataloguing and digitization [months 30, 48].	48	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	Working in collaboration with RISM (the main institution responsible for our bibliographical control of music sources) I am confident that the WG will make considerable progress with what is a vast and complicated project to assess the _digital_ presence of these precious objects.
Study on alternative publication formats and standards for music research and digital music editions.	45	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	The recent report published in the Journal of Musicological Research shows much promise. Now the pending piece in the widely-read IMS blog will be an excellent way to bring the principles articulated there to a wide audience in the scholarly community. The next step will be to ensure that performers and culture-industry stakeholders see the possibilities of these emerging best practices.
Planning and design of a comprehensive online resource (as part of the project's platform) to enhance the career advancement opportunities of musicians devoted to early music [months 24, 42].	42	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	This 'career pathways' document will be of great value to young musicians and scholars, and to the institutions who create and certify the curricula they follow.
Survey of national / European cultural policies and how they interact / affect early music; overview of support for early music [months 24, 36]; white paper on how to maximize the potential of early music from a policy perspective [month 48].	48	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	The EU community will be fortunate to have a set of clear cultural policy principles that can be implemented to preserve intangible cultural heritage in a rapidly changing, digitally mediated age. In the United States we utterly lack a national arts policy like this, and could stand to learn a great deal from the one under formulation here. Without goals, you cannot act effectively.
Regular publications within the consortium and communication to the target communities [months 13-48].	48	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	I am confident that these are emerging. The best approach is to reach out to stakeholders,

			rather than assume that they will simply "find" the web communications. The EarlyMuse team is taking the correct approach.
Early music education : data collection by ECIs at various institutions (academic and non-academic).	18	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	The responsible WG seems to have this under control, and has deep and wide connections with the institutions in question.
Design of a comprehensive online resource (as part of the project's platform) to enhance the career advancement opportunities of musicians devoted to early music.	42	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	Along with the articulation of pathways for scholars, this is an important project. It will help students imagine their trajectories at the intersection of investigative research and performance.
Paper(s) on how to assess alternative publication formats in the academic context.	36	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	This will be important to have for musicology, but of course (as the investigators recognize) has much wider implications in the world of scholarly communication in a digital age.
Prospects for creation of new outlets (hybrid journals and other alternatives). Criteria and digital tools involved in the online publication of music research and digital music editions.	45	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	Detailing best practices and practical measures that could be adopted across institutions will be an important resource. Some will be able to advance in the next two years. Others are certainly bound to be longer term, or in fact change with the rapidly evolving world of scholarly communication.
White paper on how to maximize the potential of early music from a policy perspective.	48	Not delivered, but expected before end of Action	Having such policy principles and statement will be an important resource for action by the many cultural agencies responsible for the preservation of our intangible heritage.

General Assessment of deliverables

The level of ambition of the deliverables is **high**.
Overall, **all deliverables are progressing appropriately**.

Additional outputs / achievements

Co-authored Action publications

The Action reported 1 publication on the topic of the Action, co-authored by at least two Action participants from two countries participating in the Action. The full list of publications appears in Annex I.

The:

- **Quality** of the Action's co-authored publications is **excellent**.
The publication (and above all the conversations that gave rise to it) show many emerging best practices for publication in a digital age, and already suggest some ways that stakeholders across the EU could share expertise.
- **Significance** of the Action's co-authored publications is **excellent**.
The publication (and above all the conversations that gave rise to it) show many emerging best practices for publication in a digital age, and already suggest some ways that stakeholders across the EU could share expertise.
- **Relevance** to the Action of the Action's co-authored publications is **excellent**.
The world of publishing has changed a great deal during the last two decades. Music publishing could benefit from renewed interest in the process and products, too, and this seems very relevant.
- **Quantity** of the Action's co-authored publications is **excellent**.
The report is not vast, but it details in a short span the scope and depth of the challenges and opportunities.

Projects and proposals resulting from Action activities

The Action reported the following projects resulting from Action activities involving at least one Action participant.

In addition the Action reported 1 proposals resulting from Action activities involving at least one Action participant, and for which the Action networking was necessary.

Relevance of the Action's proposals and/ or projects is **excellent**.

Quantity of the Action's proposals and/ or projects is **excellent**.

Other outputs / achievements

The Action did not report any other outputs / achievements.

Impacts

The Action reported the following impacts (the short- to long-term scientific, technological, and / or socioeconomic changes produced by a COST Action, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended) that have resulted, or might result, from the Action.

Description of the impact	Type of impact	Timing of impact
From a scientific perspective, EarlyMuse has begun to identify new directions for the future of musicological research. By focusing on publication methods and approaches to sources, the involved researchers have identified avenues that have been published in a peer-reviewed journal and in reports that are widely distributed. This work is too recent to quantitatively measure its impact. At most, the metrics concerning the article published in a journal indicate a genuine interest from researchers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Scientific / Technological 	Foreseen by the end of the Action
Validity, relevance and significance (in particular importance and timeliness) of the impact reported by the Action: This will be quite valuable and I am confident that the team is on track to complete it.		
EarlyMuse aims to tackle two economic challenges. The first concerns the future methods of publication, and the second involves the conditions for a dialogue between musicology and the cultural and creative industries. For the first, milestones have been set, and feedback will be assessed once a statement paper is published (before the end of 2024). For the second, the field is considerably more complex, particularly due to the difficulty in establishing dialogue with music distribution platforms.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Economic 	Foreseen by the end of the Action
Validity, relevance and significance (in particular importance and timeliness) of the impact reported by the Action: As a life-long researcher, I think it is unusual and very important that the EarlyMuse team is working on this, look forward to the results.		
On the societal level, the impacts will be measurable once the work on the professional sector is completed and when the new mode of dissemination for musicological research is established. The first point is crucial as it would allow for the inclusion of the 'musicology' sector in OECD statistics. Starting in October 2024, EarlyMuse has appointed a leader for gender issues. A young researcher from Croatia will oversee this central theme, particularly with regard to academic careers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Societal 	Foreseen by the end of the Action
Validity, relevance and significance (in particular importance and timeliness) of the impact reported by the Action: Equity for all scholars is vitally important, and I applaud this initiative. I am confident that their report will raise awareness and lead to action.		

The extent to which the Action has advanced the careers, skills and networks of researchers including ECIs (as described by the Action) is **very good**.

Stakeholder engagement
The most important stakeholders to be engaged thus far include REMA, RISM, and RILM. With REMA we have organized STSMs and we have joined in two REMA meetings. In November 2024 we will have a leadership meeting with REMA and also the European Association of Conservatories to establish roadmaps for educational cooperation. RISM has hosted STSMs; representatives from RISM have joined various WG meetings to help shape the nature of our cooperation. RILM has similarly been present at WG meetings and involved in working with WG 3 on the challenges of editions in the digital age. In the future, we intend to engage other stakeholders in the international nonprofit field, including organizations that are actively working toward shaping EU cultural policy. We have already made initial contact with the European Music Council, Culture Action Europe and Europa Nostra at events that they have hosted in Brussels and elsewhere. We intend to organize meetings with them by 2026 to establish partnerships that can outlast this Action.
The Rapporteur recommended that the following stakeholders should also be engaged by the Action.

General assessment of impacts

The Action's impacts are best described as follows:

Multiple highly significant impacts are reasonably foreseen for the future OR one highly or moderately significant impact is already observed [Very Good]

Dissemination and exploitation of Action results (other than co-authored Action publications listed previously)

Dissemination

Dissemination meetings funded by the Action (possible only until 31st October 2021)

Action website

<https://earlymuse.eu/>

The:

- openness and user-friendliness of the Action website are excellent
- content of the Action website (programmes and minutes of all events present, all outputs/deliverables accessible from website) is excellent

The Action website was an effective means of disseminating the Action.

Rapporteur's comment on the website

I think the design and contents are excellent. One small suggestion would be a kind of thematic guide for users who are not aware of what they can find here. Could there be a series of 'topics' or brief questions, perhaps (editions, performance, education, public engagement, etc) that would prompt visitors to explore what is here? yes, the search box is helpful--but only if you already know what to ask.

Other dissemination activities

The following other dissemination activities reported by the Action were effective and added value

Item/activity	Conference organised by third party in Dublin (Music, Musicology and Academic Responsibilities in the 21st Century)
Target Audience	Scholars working all over the worlds on different aspects of musicology and facing different issues with academic responsibility of the field.
Outcome of the activity	A first dialogue between EarlyMuse and scholars coming from all over the world.
Hyperlink	https://www.ucd.ie/music/newsandevents/conferences/musicmusicologyandacademicresponsibilities/

Item/activity	Conference organised by the Royal Musical Association ofr its 150th anniversary (London)
Target Audience	Scholars and music publishers coming from the UK (young and senior).
Outcome of the activity	A round table on the future of music editin which allows EarlyMuse to present the results of the WP Publication (monumental editions, publications of the future in musicology). EarlyMuse is invited to particpate in a reserach program supported by AHRC in connection with Musica Britannica.
Hyperlink	https://rma150.wordpress.com

Exploitation activities

No exploitation activities were reported by the Action.

Assessment of Action dissemination and exploitation activities

The effectiveness of the Action's dissemination and exploitation approach (other than co-authored publications) is assessed as follows

Social media might augment the efforts to spread knowledge of EarlyMuse and its work, but I agree that engagement with conferences is the best means to find engagement and follow through.

Assessment of Action dissemination and exploitation activities

All Action activities focusing on dissemination of Action results were effective [Very Good]

Other matters

Difficulties in implementing the Action

The Action Rapporteur made the following observations regarding difficulties in implementing the Action:

This seems a good plan, as I have noted. I am curious to know the plan for engaging performing organizations with these research agendas, too.

Emerging topics / developments in the field of the Action

The Action reported the following emerging topics / developments in the field of the Action.

- An important emerging theme is the role of musicological research--and our object of study, music--in the development of the European Cloud for Heritage. As the most important type of intangible heritage, musical heritage presents many opportunities for innovating methods and technologies in the Cloud. Yet there are many challenges as well, ranging from the copyright issues related to audiovisual recordings, to the continued challenges of Optical Music Recognition, to the most sustainable and accurate way to create a digital twin of a fragmentary musical score. Yet we are not the only field to be busy with these questions of intangible heritage, and we could imagine that the technological and philosophical issues associated with "recording" intangible heritage could be fruitful terrain for S&T Conferences or Exploratory Workshops bringing together humanists and technologists, for example.

The Action Rapporteur made the following comment on the emerging topics / developments in the field reported by the Action.

Music has always been mediated by its technologies of recording and reproduction, and so it seems particularly important that reflective, systematic work on this take place now.

Action Rapporteur

This Second Progress Report was submitted on 2024-11-27 by:
Prof Richard Freedman
Richard Freedman
United States

Annex 1: List of publications

The Action reported 1 publication on the topic of the Action, co-authored by at least two Action participants from two countries participating in the Action.

Co-authored Action publications - peer-reviewed

Title	The monumental edition in the digital age: creating a sustainable future
Authors	Andrea Puentes-Blanco ; Metoda Kokole ; Philippe Vendrix ; María Gembero-Ustároz ; Rebecca Herissone ; Christian Troelsgård ; Klemen Grabnar ; Birgit Lodes ; Kateryna Schöning ; Vilena Vrbanic doi:10.1080/09298215.2024.2373998
DOI	
Type	Journal article
Published in	Journal of New Music Research
Published by	Informa UK Limited
ISSNs	0929-8215 ; 1744-5027
Link	https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/09298215.2024.2373998